



Civil Society Recommendations to the 2016 Civil20 Summit, Qingdao City, 5-6 July 2016
Submission from civil society members from the BRICSAM region
(Brazil, Russia, India, Indonesia, China, South Africa and Mexico)

Introduction

Civil society organisations from the BRICSAM region (Brazil, Russia, India, Indonesia, China, South Africa and Mexico, brought together through the “**Empowering Civil Society Networks (ECSN) from a Multi-polar World**” project have developed a joint set of G20 policy recommendations for the **2016 Civil20 Communiqué**. The ECSN policy recommendations are focused on the thematic areas of **Domestic Resource Mobilisation (DRM)/ tax; food security /climate change; and, gender**, given their significance to overcoming inequality and achieving some of the most pertinent issues of the United Nations 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.

These recommendations build on the previous G20 Summit commitments to support key areas for sustainable development such as domestic resource mobilisation; financial inclusion (reducing the gender participation gap); food security; climate change; and, energy access. Our policy recommendations are further linked to the current 2016 G20 Hangzhou Summit priorities under “Inclusive and interconnected development,” which seeks to improve inclusive and interconnected growth calls for implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.

As stated in the Antalya Summit G20 Leaders’ Communiqué, the 2030 Agenda, including the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the Addis Ababa Action Agenda, sets a transformative, universal and ambitious framework for global development efforts. We encourage G20 leaders to uphold their commitment to implementing its outcomes to ensure that no one is left behind in efforts to eradicate poverty and build an inclusive and sustainable future for all. The SDGs cannot be achieved globally if they are not realised in all G20 countries, and without strong support and leadership by the G20 in low- and middle-income countries (beyond the G20).

2016 G20 Recommendations on DRM / Tax

Background

Domestic Resource Mobilisation (DRM) has been viewed as an important means by which the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) can be financed. There is an apparent financing gap to reach the targets agreed up on Agenda 2030.¹ In G20 countries where there is sufficient domestic

¹ Financing the targets set forth in the United Nations 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development is of significant concern. Though the estimates of financing needs vary greatly, the UN Intergovernmental Committee of Experts on Sustainable Development Financing has indicated that eradicating extreme poverty (from the current \$1.25-a- day standard) in countries across the globe would cost \$66 billion annually. UNCTAD has estimated that developing countries would need an investment of \$3.3 to \$4.5 trillion annually, with the current investments standing at \$1.4 trillion. UN estimates of annual investment in infrastructure to sustainably alleviate poverty through growth and job creation require between \$5 to \$7 trillion globally.

resource mobilisation, corruption and the inefficient and ineffective use of resources are major challenges. The existing efforts to raise resources through DRM are hampered by unfair tax systems, illicit outflows and tax havens, and the absence of an international tax body to regulate and stop wide spread tax evasion and avoidance.

Well-functioning, progressive domestic and international tax regimes are essential to reduce inequality, finance public services, ensure human rights and achieve the aspirations of Agenda 2030. A progressive tax system should aim to share the tax burden fairly to level the playing field. G20 governments must act together to correct this imbalance by shifting the tax burden away from labour and consumption and towards wealth, capital and income from assets. While DRM has been viewed as an important source of revenue, Overseas Development Assistance (ODA), being 0.7% of GNI is still essential to complement and reinforce the effectiveness of domestic resources for sustainable development.

A number of national and regional development banks have entered the international area, and the recent addition is BRICS New Development Bank (NDB) and the Asia Infrastructure Investment Bank (AIIB), which are becoming global actors. Development banks focus on large scale infrastructure, which is necessary for economic growth. However, at the same time, this entails considerable social and ecological costs. It has severe implications on the displacements of local populations and destruction of natural resources. Multilateral banks and international financial institutions have a vital role to play in support of Agenda 2030, and need to review their policies to consider the SDGs in their plans.

Recommendations on domestic resource mobilisation / tax

(1) Establishment of a fair, progressive, and redistributive international tax system

- Go beyond proposed international tax cooperation towards a broader, more inclusive inter-governmental body on tax (IGBT). This would include equal participation through equal rights, including voting.
- Develop a clear timetable for establishment of the IGBT, which would oversee the implementation of a fair international tax system, with democratic and inclusive processes in relation to the BEPS process and beyond.
- Address imbalances of tax systems by shifting the tax burden away from labour and consumption and towards wealth, capital and income from assets.
- Ensure that taxation systems and policies recognise unequal gender roles, and develop/improve redistribution tax policies taking gender into consideration, including the unfair tax impacts on women and children.

(2) Country by Country Reporting (CBCR)

- CBCR to be available publicly, up to the project level. To ensure participation by all countries in CBCR, the G20 should provide technical assistance, including financial support for developing countries (technical assistance for non-reciprocal nations so that the developing countries



can have enough time to make adjustment to avoid adverse impact and benefit from information exchange under the principle of reciprocity).

- Multinational corporations should publicly disclose information through country-by-country reporting, up to the project level related to the payments they make. This is especially relevant to extractive industries; telecommunications; agribusiness; and infrastructure development sectors in developing countries.

(3) Automatic exchange of information (AEOI)

- Implement AEOI, which would include a clear timetable for implementation and appropriate enforcement mechanisms.

(4) Beneficial Ownership

- The G20 should share the implementation plans on beneficial ownership, and make information on beneficial ownership registries public.

(5) Tax at Source

- Ensure that multinational enterprises are taxed where their economic activities take place and value is created.

Recommendations on Aid Commitment of 0.7% for ODA

(1) The G20 should ensure that developed countries recommit 0.7 per cent of their GNI towards ODA, in order to complement and reinforce the effectiveness of domestic resources for sustainable development. G20 countries should establish a time frame for meeting this obligation by 2017, under the German Presidency.

Recommendations on the Role of Multi-lateral banks and Infrastructure Development

(1) Accelerate the reform process of governance of International Financial Institutions and multi-lateral development banks. There should be equal voting rights for both developed and developing countries to make the process more transparent and democratic.

(2) Inclusive growth should be the key criterion of investment for the development banks. It is important to ensure that investments in infrastructure and services meet the interests of socially and economically disadvantaged communities. This can be done by ensuring that social, environmental and human rights safeguards are established to protect and promote the interests of everyone affected by the projects it funds, as well as putting in place transparency and accountability mechanisms.

2016 G20 Recommendations on Gender

Background

Key challenges for women, related to women's equal participation in political and economic spheres include the lack of quantitative indicators for women's increased participation in workforce for women and need for qualitative indicators. There is a need to create a women's financial hub in an effort to increase women's financial inclusion given the lack of a true mechanism to advance

women's entrepreneurship with financial support. The financial hub would facilitate the mobilisation of both material and information resources, and funding devoted to increase women's entrepreneurship.

On the allocation of resources for women, G20 countries need to establish an effective budgeting system for women to ensure that public money is spent in more gender equitable ways, given the uneven ways in which national budgets impact differently on women and men. Budgeting is both a technical and a political exercise. From a technical standpoint, it estimates or calculates the sum of financial and non-financial resources needed to implement national commitments on gender equality, women's rights and women's empowerment, such as budgeting a national strategy or plan on gender equality, a sector-specific intervention or law. On the other hand, it is a political exercise that ensures that governments are prioritising and acting according to their gender equality, women's rights and women's empowerment commitments by allocating sufficient funds for this purpose. In other words, gender responsive public budgets are an indicator of government commitment to women's rights, gender equality and women's empowerment. There should be clear mandates of resource allocation for women that can be measured in their impact and scope for specific 'gender budgeting' and provision of other resources geared towards the needs of women.

Women need to participate in public policy-making process, not simply as beneficiaries but as direct participants in both political and economic spheres from the beginning of planning stages through to the implementation phase. There must be recognition of the intersection of gender with age, socioeconomic status and ethnic origin. The following gender recommendations build on the foundations of the G20's work on gender, under the first Women20 under the 2015 Turkish presidency to achieve gender equality and women's economic empowerment, and under the 2014 G20 Brisbane Summit whereby G20 leaders set the target of reducing the gap in participation rates between men and women. These recommendations address the constraints for women to participate, particularly in political and economic sectors, while structural violence² persists throughout G20 countries, and globally.

(1) End structural violence

- Address legal, cultural and religious barriers (such as parental/marital consent, access to and ownership of land) that hamper women's access to economic and social rights³ and justice.

² Structural violence refers to "the political-economic organization of society that imposes conditions of physical and emotional distress, from high morbidity and mortality rates to poverty and abusive working conditions. It is rooted, at the macro-level, in structures such as unequal international terms of trade and it is expressed locally in exploitative labour markets, marketing arrangements and the monopolization of services". (Bourgeois, 2001) Bourgeois, P. (2001) *The power of violence in war and peace: Post-Cold War lessons from El Salvador*. University of California, San Francisco.

³ According to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, economic and social rights derive from the innate dignity of human beings and include: the right to education, the right to an decent standard of living (including adequate food, clothing and housing) the



- Research by and about women on the manifestation, impact, and depth of violence is disseminated through public and private investment in publications and advertisement, which contributes to positive social norms.
- Challenge and transform social norms which discriminate women, working with different actors who influence norms (such as traditional leaders, public figures, women's rights organisations and the media).
- Public institutions and private companies should ensure that policies and practices support transformation of social norms related to women's economic empowerment.
- Respect and protect the bodily integrity of women and girls by enforcing the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW).

(2) Women-centric economic, political, social approaches

- Create specific policies targeting marginalization (and take into consideration their intersections- age, ethnicity, sexuality, class, disability, etc.)
- Develop/enhance mechanisms to facilitate women's participation in policy-making processes at all levels by not only including women (and increasing the rate of women's participation), but also by developing policies that specifically aim to fulfil the rights of women.
- Ensuring that taxation systems and policies recognise unequal gender roles, and develop/improve redistribution tax policies taking gender into consideration, including the unfair tax impacts on women and children. Taxation of certain goods (ex. feminine sanitary products) affects women unequally.
- Promote a universal social protection floor that ensures protection for women.

(3) Systematically recognise and measure all forms of work including unpaid care work⁴

- Provide mechanisms for public/private employment opportunities for women (that includes a consideration of the informal economy).
- Target employment policies to create decent jobs for women both in cities and rural areas, eliminate gender wage gaps and occupational segregation⁵.

right to highest attainable standards of physical and mental health, the right to form trade unions and join a trade union, the right to social security and the right to decent and just work, among others.

⁴ Unpaid care work refers to all unpaid services provided within a household for its members, including care of persons, housework and voluntary community work. These activities are considered work, because theoretically one could pay a third person to perform them. Some examples include looking after and educating children, looking after older family members, caring for the sick, preparing food, cleaning, and collecting water and fuel. Due to prevailing gender norms, women and girls undertake most of the burden of unpaid care work, which undermines women and girls' rights (to decent work, to education, to health, to rest and leisure), limits their opportunities and, therefore, impedes their economic empowerment. hinders women from seeking employment and income, which in turn holds them back economically.



- Reduce gap in participation rates between women and men (100 million women into labour force).
- Promote labour legislation that improves the bargaining power and position of women.
- Commit to addressing and recognising unpaid care work – divide between the types of jobs that women do and how these are valued (e.g. lower paid sectors, the ‘three cs’ – catering, caring and cleaning).
- Encompass all of the above, and additional concerns by endorsing and implementing the recommendations of the UN high level report on Women’s Economic Empowerment (see: <https://www.empowerwomen.org/en/who-we-are/initiatives/sg-high-level-panel-on-womens-economic-empowerment>).

(4) Increase the levels of influence and participation of feminist leaders

- Raise quotas of women in decision-making positions.
- Enable women's impactful participation in governance, including economic justice⁶.
- Support accountability in upholding the feminist-centred commitments⁷.
- Create mechanisms to protect and enable women’s participation in leadership positions and ensure their safety/security.
- Promote collaboration with feminist leaders and civil society in the working groups at a national and international level, as well as in the official delegations that participate in other spaces (B20, L20 etc) and the G20.

(5) Secure opportunities, access, and autonomy for young women and girls

⁵ Occupational segregation refers to how gender norms’ that translate into barriers that influence mens’ and womens’ preferences and behaviour towards occupation. These barriers to entry into occupations range from lack of information about alternative job options to active discouragement and harrasment.

⁶ Women struggle disproportionately with poverty and this economic vulnerability enables exploitation by employers, family members, and others in their communities. In this context, economic justice refers to ending the multiple and interconnected vulnerabilities women experience through public policies that recognise women as valuable and critical drivers of local and globale economies and secure an environment with greater economic opportunities and holistic labor policies for women. Economic justice includes dealing with issues such as the glass ceiling, welfare reform, decent work, ending job discrimination, pay equity, housing, social security, pension reform/ and more.

⁷ Feminist centered commitments refer to the pledges made by States to carry out concrete actions that acknowledge how patriarchal society has created inequalities for women, which negatively impact the fulfillment of their rights and their access to opportunities. Through these commitments, States pledge to tackle the social, cultural, economic, political and legal structures that create inequalities for women. Examples of these feminist centered commitments are the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women. In relation to these commitments, accountability, and the participation of feminist leaders, it refers to the critical role that feminist leaders play in ensuring that the State complies with the obligations to fulfill its’ feminist centered commitments.

- Access to education, technology, health, and work and the means to take advantage of them
- Recognise and respecting the identities of all (indigenous, sexuality, gender, race, religion, disability, etc.)
- Create and enforce laws addressing child labour

2016 G20 Recommendations on Food Security and Climate Change

Background

Achieving sustainable development means ensuring that all people have the needed resources – such as food, income, water, healthcare and energy – to fulfil their human rights. And it means ensuring that humanity's use of natural resources does not stress critical Earth system processes by causing climate change and/or biodiversity loss. Biodiversity is critical to ensuring environmental sustainability.

There is an estimated 15 gigatonnes of emission reduction gap to hold the increase in the global average temperature to below 2 °C above pre-industrial levels or to 1.5 °C (UNFCCC). 84 per cent of global fossil fuel emissions come from G20 countries (OECD). In accordance with Turkey C20 Communiqué, the G20 Leaders are urged to agree on fair and equitable long term emission reduction and decarbonisation goal, and commit to a 100% renewable energy future by 2050, and to make energy efficiency and renewable energy an infrastructure investment priority.

G20 Leaders have committed to improve global food security, nutrition and the sustainability of food systems with particular attention to the needs of smallholder and family farmers, rural women and youth, as per their commitments in 2015 G20 Action Plan on Food Security and Sustainable Food Systems (under the 2015 Turkish Presidency) and the G20 Food Security and Nutrition Framework (under the 2014 Australian Presidency).

There is a need to further address the dependence of multinational companies (MNCs), which has led to the neglect of the important role of small-scale farmers' role and aggravated the challenges associated with food security and food systems. G20 countries need to support the ability of more people-centred national public policies to be able to counter patterns of consumption imposed by MNCs, which often pose public health problems linked to the free entry of poor quality foods at low prices. The increasing control of the few large local and foreign corporations over the food environment and the unregulated operations of the fast food sector have contributed to the marginalisation of indigenous agriculture and foods and resulted in an environment saturated with unhealthy, cheap, ultra-processed food products and sugary beverages. The double burden of malnutrition and ill-health associated with this inadequate diet is increasing food and nutritional poverty, with the consequent diseases having to be covered by the state and the individual household.

The following recommendations address the continued challenges of creating a sustainable food system for the world, and tackling climate change and its effects.

1. Fair trade

- Promote fair trade that prioritises the needs of developing countries, given the unequal trade treaties and agreements between developed and under developed countries associated with regulations with food safety. Trade and investment agreements should provide policy space for developing country governments to protect and promote domestic food producers towards food sovereignty (and not be subjected to unwanted products / dumping practices).

2. Inclusive approach to agricultural development, appropriate technology and funding support

- Support national initiatives to upskill and build the capacity of small and medium scale farmers, reinforcing their role as producers within the food system, as well as small and independent input suppliers.
- Give funding support and access to small-scale farmers to financial institutions; access to appropriate markets; technical support and extension services (not linked to specific brands or corporations); and, access to inputs that are derived from sources other than MNCs.
- Strengthen access to natural resources (land/water) for small and medium scale farmers to increase productivity.

3. Adaptation, mitigation and resilience

- G20 countries should ratify the Paris Agreement as soon as possible within 2017, and commit to accelerating the decarbonisation of economies by 2050.
- Operationalise the long-term emission reduction goal in national development planning in line with deep decarbonisation pathway to limit the global temperature increase well below 2 degree C and aim for the 1.5 degree C vision as agreed to in the Paris Package. Urgently increase the ambition in current Intended Nationally Determined Contributions (INDCs) in light of the 2018 global stock take, to close the emission reduction gap, and ensure future NDCs represent a progression beyond the currently communicated NDCs and reflect the highest ambition. Future NDCs should move the world along an emissions pathway that is consistent with the temperature goals of the Paris Agreement.
- Developed countries (G20 countries where applicable) should develop a work plan that clearly illustrates the fulfilment of the \$100 billion/year pledge up until 2020 as a financial floor (minimum) for the Green Climate Fund. It is in this way that adequate funding to climate adaptation and mitigation for developing countries can be accessed.
- One of the measures to hold countries accountable and responsible to the amount of emissions they produce is found in accelerating the development of Articles 13 & 15 in the Paris Agreement - which deals with transparency and compliance. The availability of adequate information will also empower civil society in the work being done. G20 countries must clarify modalities of article 13 and 15 so as to fully adhere to universally applicable, robust transparency and compliance mechanisms.
- Increase community resilience should be primary in developing disaster risk management strategies.

- Governments should develop agricultural strategies that promote investments in small-scale farmers which will generate employment and mitigate climate change.

4. Energy

- Increase public support for renewable energy to ensure affordable, reliable and sustainable energy access for all by 2030, especially to strengthen livelihoods in rural area of developing countries.
- Expand infrastructure and upgrade technology for supplying modern and sustainable energy services for all in developing countries, namely energy access technology.
- Operationalise technology transfer and financial support as well as capacity building for developing countries to develop and maintain renewable and energy efficiency infrastructure.
- Shifting investment away from fossil fuels into renewable and energy efficiency yield huge economic benefits.
- The G20 should make a joint commitment to a 100% renewable energy future by 2050, and prioritise energy efficiency and renewable energy investment in infrastructure development.
- Put an immediate end to inefficient fossil fuel subsidies and aim for a full phase-out of remaining fossil fuel subsidies by 2030 in an equitable way, with targeted policies to ensure that low-income households do not suffer adverse effects (from the removal of subsidies).
- Accelerate G20 peer review necessary for the implementation of the commitment, and agree upon a transparent and consistent system for tracking and reporting.
- G20 nations should set an exit-date for coal, and phase out fossil fuel subsidies by 2030 in an equitable way.
- Provide financial support for least-developed countries and vulnerable nations to undergo low-carbon transitions.
- Accelerate the pricing on carbon on all G20 economies.

Organisation Endorsements

- International NGO Forum on Indonesian Development (INFID), Indonesia
- Koalisi Perempuan, Indonesia
- Perkumpulan Prakarsa, Indonesia
- Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability (CBGA), India
- International Coalition for Development Action- México (CAIDMEX)
- Non-Profit Partnership EVA, Russia
- Economic Justice Network (EJN) of FOCCISA, South Africa
- Project 90 by 2030 (P90), South Africa
- Studies in Poverty and Inequality Institute (SPII), South Africa
- Eastern Cape Environmental Network (ECEN), South Africa
- South African Council of Churches (SACC), South Africa
- Oxfam South Africa (OZA)